Mr. Javed Ahmad Ghamidi vs. Ali Sina Part 5

Javed Ahmad Ghamidi vs. Ali Sina

2006/09/30

Drear Mr. Ghamidi and Mr. Zaheer.

Greetings and thank you for the response. You have been brief and to the point. I will try to do the same.

1- In your introduction to Sura Naba Mr. Ghamidi, you quoted verses 78: 37-40 and in the footnote you wrote:

“This and the next two verses strongly negate the philosophy of mediation and intercession.”

I agreed with that and affirmed that intercession makes no sense.

But then I pointed out that many Muslims believe that intercession is possible and I quoted several verses that make that belief plausible.

However in your latest response you indicated, “intercession would only be needed by, and allowed to, people belonging to the third category.”

So obviously I had not understood you right at first or you are having second thoughts. It appears to me that now you say that intercession is possible. Is my understanding correct?

If intercession is not possible, I would like you to explain why in so many places Muhammad claims that he will be the intercessor and that others to whom permission has been given can also intercede.

If intercession is possible, then we have a logical problem to solve. Doesn’t God know everything? What can possibly any intercessor tell Him that He does not know already? The Quranic verses say that intercession would be allowed to those who speak the truth. This makes no sense at all. Can anyone tell a lie to God when he already knows everything? Why does he need the opinion of others when he knows best? What is the point in talking to God when he already knows what we are going to say and we know that he knows what is in our heart? Isn't this an exercise in futility?

Furthermore if God’s wisdom, compassion and mercy exceeds those of his creatures why would he need any creature of him to tell him please be more forgiving and merciful to some of your weaker creatures? Can possibly anyone be more merciful to other humans than God?

When I agreed with you, it was because I understood you say the Quran “strongly negates the philosophy of mediation and intercession”. But this does not seem to be the case. So I can’t agree with you and you should explain logically why an all knowing, all wise God needs intercession by his creatures. Is there anything that God does not know that the intercessor can inform him? The philosophy of intercession denies not only the omniscience of God but also his mercy and fairness. It concept on intercession implies that Muhammad and “those to whom permission is given” know things that Allah does not know, or that they are more forgiving and merciful that him.

You brought the example of an employee who is loyal but not very efficient and that his employer tolerates some of his ineptitudes in consideration of his loyalty. Let us agree with this premise. The question is why this employer needs someone to intercede with him on behalf of this lousy but loyal employee? An intercessor would only make sense if the employer does not have the full knowledge of the situation. So he would ask the opinion of the superior of this employee who knows him best. But if God knows everything better than anyone else, is wiser than all his creation and his prophets, why would he need anyone's opinion? Doesn’t this imply that Muhammad knows something about humans that Allah does not know?

According to Islam, Allah is perfect while Muhammad and Muslims are not. Will you please explain why a perfect being would listen to the opinions of imperfect creatures? If the claim that Allah knows best is true, then intercession by creatures who don’t know anywhere close to what Allah knows is not needed at all and is sheer arrogance. Does Muhammad and other devout Muslims know the secrets of people's heart better than God?

The concept of intercession is nothing but blasphemy. Muhammad is claiming to have the power to act as God’s advisor. He even grants this preposterous privilege to his followers. This is absurd. What possibly anyone can tell God that He already does not know? If someone deserves a break because of his loyalty or for any other reason, shouldn’t God know that better than his prophet? By claiming that he has the power to intercede with God, Muhammad in assuming the role of the Almighty’s partner.

You wrote: “In other words, the Almighty would Himself identify the people who would be allowed to intercede and the ones they would be allowed to intercede for. In the process of intercession, they would not speak anything but the truth.”

This makes no sense at all. I can’t understand the logic of this protocol. How can an omniscient God, appoint some humans to intercede? Let us say God decides to punish someone for a sin. Has he made his decision wisely or not? Is his decision based on knowledge or is it based on ignorance? Then he appoints some good Muslims to intercede on behalf of this individual. These Muslims prostrate in front of Allah and tell him, oh Allah, please forgive this man because he was a loyal Muslim and Allah, after thinking for while and hearing some supplications, changes his mind and says, "Okay, because you interceded I will forgive him." Doesn’t this sound ludicrous? If this individual deserves to be forgiven why God does not forgive him in the first place? What these Muslims can possibly

tell God that He does not know already and how a bunch of humans can influence the decision of the maker of this universe? Is God so whimsical? Doesn't this imply that his original decision was not right? If it was right why change it? If it was not right because it was based on the faulty information then God is not all knowing.

Funny thing is that Allah already knows that his decision is not right and the person deserves better treatment. So he asks his prophet and some good Muslims to beg for him to change his decision and make it right.

We should also remember verse *7.188* where allegedly Allah tells Muhammad to says:

> I have no power over any good or harm to myself except as Allah willeth. If I had knowledge of the unseen, I should have multiplied all good, and no evil should have touched me: I am but a warner, and a bringer of glad tidings to those who have faith.

We have also this hadith:

> I am a Prophet of Allah **but I do not know what will be my end.** (Bukhari, Sahih Bukhari, Chapter "Al-Janaiz")

In one of his sermons calculated to instill the fear of Allah and the day of reckoning in the hearts of men, he said:

> O people of Quraish be prepared for the hereafter, I cannot save you from the punishment of Allah; O Bani Abd Manaf, I cannot save you from Allah; O Abbas, son of Abdul Mutalib, I cannot protect you either; O Fatima, daughter of Muhammad, even you I cannot save. (Sahahin) 1
>
> (https://www.faithfreedom.org/debates/Ghamidip4.htm#_ftn1)

How can then such a person who has no power over anything except what Allah tells him, and does not know what will be his own end claim to know that he will be an advisor to Allah on the Day of Judgment advocating for the Muslims?

Imagine Allah sitting on his throne and condemning a Muslim to Hell, knowing that this person deserves better. So he turns to Muhammad and tell him to intercede for that Muslim. Mo goes on his knees and intercedes and then Allah smiles and tells the Muslim, I have forgiven your sin because of Muhammad.

This is comedy. It is clear that Muhammad said something at one time and then forgot and said something else at another time. The whole story is just ridiculous. This is enough proof that he was making it all up.

Now imagine this scene happening billions of times, once for every Muslim that ever lived and had a grain of faith in Muhammad. (All Muslims have that much faith or they would not call themselves Muslim.) Let us say there will be about 3 billion Muslims in total, since the beginning of Islam to the Day of Resurrection and let us say it takes just one minute for

Muhammad to intercede on behalf of each one of them. That is really fast justice. At this rate, if Muhammad and Allah work non stop, 24 hours per day and all days of the year, the Day of Judgment will have to last 5707 years. Now imagine you have lived 60 or 70 years in this world and will have to stand in line over five thousand years to receive your judgment. If there are twice that many Muslims, then the Day of Judgment will last 11414 years. If the intercession ritual takes more than one minute per person the waiting time will be even longer. If Allah or Muhammad take coffee breaks, you'll have to stand in like a few extra thousands of years. We are not even counting the time that it will take to process the non-Muslims because we assume that they will all be herded to hell like the Jews being sent to Nazi gas chambers and Allah will not waste a minute of his time on them.

If the Quran says intercession is possible, the Quran is engaging in a logical fallacy. It is undermining the omniscience of God and is confuting His superior wisdom and mercy.

My dear erudite friends, I think you have a big logical problem in front of you. You either must accept intercession or reject it. If you reject it, then explain why Muhammad claims to have that power and if you accept it then you are engaging in blasphemy, which is even a bigger problem.

2- In response to my second question asking why Allah in the Quran abruptly changes pronouns and sometimes refers to himself in third person you said that it is because the Quran “is a masterpiece of Arabic literature”.

I agree that sometimes a speaker or a writer speaks of himself in third person and this is acceptable. However this is not the recipe to transform a dull writing into a masterpiece of literature. The Quran is not a masterpiece of literature by any standard. If we continue this debate long enough, I would certainly show you the errors in the Quran that prove clearly that the author of this book was indeed an illiterate man and not God. Switching from one pronoun to another without notice, only creates confusion and it does not transform a prosaic writing into a masterpiece of literature.

This topic in my view is clear. Please click on Next to see my next question.

1

(https://www.faithfreedom.org/debates/Ghamidip4.htm#_ftnref1) http://www.usc.edu/dept/MSA/fundamentals/prophet/prophetdescription.html